

# THE UNIVERSITY OF TENNESSEE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

# MINUTES OF THE WINTER MEETING February 19, 2020 Chattanooga, Tennessee

The Winter Meeting of The University of Tennessee Board of Trustees was held at 1:30 p.m. EST, on Friday, February 19, 2020, in the UTC University Center on the campus of University of Tennessee at Chattanooga.

#### I. Call to Order and Invocation

The Chair of the Board, John C. Compton, called the meeting to order and recognized UTC Campus Minister Jason Leonard, who gave the invocation.

#### II. Roll Call

Board Secretary Cynthia Moore called the roll, and the following members of the Board were present: John C. Compton, Chair; Student Trustee Spencer Ammen; Brad Box; Commissioner Charlie Hatcher; Decosta E. Jenkins; William (Bill) C. Rhodes III; Donald J. Smith; Kim H. White, Alan Wilson and Jamie Woodson.

The Secretary announced the presence of a quorum. Trustees Amy Miles and Kara Lawson were unable to attend the meeting. Others present included University faculty, staff, and students, members of the general public, and media representatives. The meeting was webcast for the convenience of the University community, the general public, and the media.

## III. Welcome and Opening Remarks of the Chair

Chair Compton thanked Chancellor Angle and his team for all their efforts in hosting the Board. He expressed the Board's appreciation for the opportunity to engage with students, tour a number of the campus facilities, and learn more about programs offered at UTC in support of student success.

# IV. Honorary Resolution

Bill Rhodes, Chair of the Finance and Administration Committee, and David Miller, Chief Financial Officer and Senior Vice Chancellor, presented a resolution honoring Mr. James (Ron) Maples for his 43 years of dedicated and exceptional service to the University, most recently in the role of Treasurer. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board approved *Honorary Resolution 001-2020*.



# V. Requests to Address the Board

Chair Compton recognized Ms. Katie Galyon, a senior at UTK and President and founder of Students Protecting Student Funding. Ms. Galyon explained that the organization is dedicated to advocating for change in the allocation of the student programming and services fee (SPSF). She expressed the students' concerns regarding the record low number of events funded by SPSF and the limited involvement of students in planning and executing such events. The organization is seeking greater transparency as to how the SPSF is being awarded.

Donde Plowman, Chancellor of UTK, discussed recent changes in staffing, as well as improvements to the website to provide more transparency regarding the use of the SPSF. Interim President Boyd indicated that the new process was meant to allow for meaningful student input, continued leadership opportunities, and broader support of more student organizations. He noted that, as this is the first year under the new policy, a year-end review would be appropriate. The Board members requested a follow-up report.

A copy of the prepared remarks of Ms. Galyon are filed with these minutes.

#### VI. President's Address

Chair Compton made a change in the agenda order and requested that Interim President Boyd provide his update to the Board.

Interim President Boyd began his address by expressing his gratitude to Chancellor Angle and the entire team at UTC for the wonderful welcome. He stated that the highlight for him was the opportunity to directly engage with students and other members of the UTC community.

#### A New World's Record

Interim President Boyd then made a surprise introduction of the UTC student rocket team (the Rocket Mocs), including past members of the team who serve as advisors and the team's faculty advisor –

- Andrew Byrd, Sean Conway, Jonathan DeGuzman, Mason Gregoire, and Alex Trotter;
- Ashwyn Sam, advisor and member of the 2018 Rocket Mocs;
- Dillon Grider, advisor and member of 2017 Rocket Mocs;
- John Brand, simulation advisor; and
- Dr. Trevor Elliott, UC Foundation Assistant Professor, UTC Mechanical Engineering

Interim President Boyd advised that the Rocket Mocs are the #1 team in the country. The team recently set a world record with a rocket launch of 17,267 feet; the previous world record was 15,101 feet. The Rocket Mocs' win was announced this week by the Tripoli Rocketry Association. The members of the Board of Trustees and the audience gave a round of applause to congratulate the team for its extraordinary accomplishment.



## Greatest Decade in the History of the University of Tennessee

Interim President Boyd indicated that this is the first meeting of the Board in what will be the "Greatest Decade in the History of the University of Tennessee." He explained that he does not mean any disrespect to those who have come before, but that the leadership team has an obligation to continue to build upon the University's strong foundation. In this regard, Interim President Boyd shared information as to the many accomplishments made during the era of 1961-1971 under the leadership of President Andy Holt. He stated his confidence that, in working together, the University community will meet this challenge.

# Government Relations Update

The successful efforts of the University's government relations team were highlighted. Interim President Boyd noted that the improved relationship with the state legislature is reflected in the increased level of state funding support. He presented a summary of additional funding streams to the University, as contemplated under the Governor's budget proposal, including \$10 million for the Oak Ridge Institute (ORI). In addition to state funding, the University is seeking federal research funding for ORI in the amount of \$20 million, through a competitive award process. He concluded his remarks in this area, by updating the Board on the successful results of the legislative hearings held regarding the Performance Audit (Sunset Audit), along with the confirmation hearings for Trustee Brad Box.

## Enrollment/Access/UT Promise

Interim President Boyd affirmed the University's commitment to improving access. He discussed the expected increase in enrollment from the UT Promise initiative, and he provided statistical information on how the introduction of the TN Promise resulted in a 7% increase in enrollment for higher education institutions state-wide. He also explained how the mentoring part of the UT Promise program will improve retention, noting that students with a mentor have a 400% greater chance of graduating. Additionally, the UT Promise should continue to lower the number of students graduating with debt. He concluded his remarks pertaining to the program by making an appeal for UT Promise mentors.

#### Research and Engagement

Updates on research were presented at the Education, Research and Service Committee meeting held earlier in the day. Interim President Boyd indicated that the budget for ORI will be presented at a future meeting, once more information is known regarding the funding provided at both the state and federal level. Interim President Boyd also shared information on other research efforts, including the OneHealth initiative.

## Engagement/Outreach

Interim President Boyd gave an update on UT Day on the Hill, and the University's new approach in asking what we can do for the State of Tennessee. He outlined a number of opportunities where the University can partner and be of service to the state through both the Institute for Public Service (IPS) and the UT Institute of Agriculture (UTIA) and its extension offices.



Interim President Boyd concluded his remarks by repeating that this will be the "Greatest Decade in the History of Tennessee."

## Questions/Comments

In response to a question from the Chair, Interim President Boyd indicated that one of the biggest challenges, which also has the highest level of opportunity, is the critical need to continue to advance collaboration across the UT System (a One UT mindset). Commissioner Hatcher thanked Interim President Boyd for the University's efforts and willingness to leverage its resources in support of priorities that will serve the State of Tennessee.

## VII. Review of Lecturer Compensation Analysis

Chair Compton stated that the next item on the agenda is in response to concerns regarding lecturer pay that were raised by Dr. Anne Langendorfer, a lecturer at UTK, who addressed the Board at its last meeting. Mr. Miller presented the findings of a benchmarking study (by campus and college), with peer data for non-tenure track adjunct faculty. He reported that the assessment shows some very large salary swings, along with a wide differential in the mean and median, in lecturer salaries. He reviewed the data source for the report and discussed the challenges associated with the inconsistent terminology used internally/externally (i.e., lecturer, instructor, other non-rank, non-tenure track faculty). Mr. Miller concluded his remarks by indicating that the assessment demonstrates the need to perform further analysis. Interim President Boyd shared his views that, to be a top employer both within the State of Tennessee and among institutions of higher education, the University must prioritize fair and competitive salary and benefits and that a more holistic study, not limited to lecturers, is needed.

# VIII. Update on UTIA/UTK Reunification

Chancellor Plowman and Senior Vice President and Senior Vice Chancellor Tim Cross provided an update on the work being done to advance the UTIA/UTK Reunification. They highlighted the emphasis that has been placed on the land grant mission and the establishment of working groups (comprised of faculty, staff and students) to address a number of areas (student services, research, academic affairs and shared governance, communications and marketing, and finance and administration processes). Chancellor Plowman shared that UTIA is represented on all strategic visioning committees. Dr. Cross explained that the reunification process has identified long-standing issues for students, such as difficulties for getting to class on time (bus schedule), that will be resolved through these efforts. The members of the Board thanked Chancellor Plowman and Dr. Cross for their leadership in this very important undertaking.

## IX. Appointment of Mark Paganelli as Treasurer

Interim President Boyd presented his recommendation for the promotion and appointment of Mr. Mark Paganelli as Treasurer of the University. Information regarding Mr. Paganelli's qualifications and the initial salary associated with the position was provided to the Board in advance of the meeting. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board approved the appointment of Mark Paganelli as Treasurer, including his initial compensation, as set forth in *Resolution* 003-2020.



## X. Committee Reports

# Report and Recommendations of the Finance and Administration Committee.

Committee Chair Rhodes provided a review of the items recommended by the Committee for approval by the Board. As all of the Board members attended the Finance and Administration Committee meeting earlier in the morning where these items were discussed at length, he advised that he would keep his remarks brief in connection with bringing forward the proposed action items.

## Revised FY 2019-20 Operating Budget

Committee Chair Rhodes explained that the University is required to develop and submit a revised operating budget each year to adjust for changes that occur after the original budget is adopted. The revisions to the operating budget are nominal. The revised Unrestricted Educational and General (E&G) Operating Budget shows an increase of 0.5% over the original budget, and the revised Unrestricted Auxiliary Operating Budget has an insignificant change of approximately \$4,200. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board approved the revised operating budget, as set forth in *Resolution 004-2020*, by unanimous roll call vote.

## > FY 2020-21 Tuition and Fees for UT Health Science Center

Committee Chair Rhodes reminded the Board that the academic calendar for UTHSC is different than the other campuses, which requires presentation and approval of FY 2020-21 Tuition and Fees at this meeting. He commended the work of Chancellor Schwab and his team, along with the Advisory Board, for bringing forward a schedule that includes no tuition increases for the upcoming year and for reductions in certain programs. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board approved the proposed tuition and fees schedule, as set forth in *Resolution 005-2020*, by unanimous roll call vote.

#### > UTHSC Campus Master Plan Update

Committee Chair Rhodes expressed his gratitude to the remarkable work done by Chancellor Schwab and Dr. Ken Brown, Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operations Officer, on the campus master plan update for UTHSC. The changes to the campus have been remarkable, and the future vision for the campus is inspiring. The Committee is recommending approval of the campus master plan update, which is on the Consent Agenda for today's meeting.

#### Report of the Executive Committee

#### Amendments to the Bylaws

Upon the recommendation of the Executive Committee, amendments to the Bylaws have been proposed, most of which are technical clarifications. Chair Compton indicated that there is one substantive change, which relates to removing the president as an ex officio, voting member of the Education, Research and Service Committee and the Finance and Administration Committee. He explained that, as the president does not serve on the Board, it would be a best governance practice to not have the president serve as a voting member of a Board standing committee.



Interim President Boyd expressed his support for the revision to the Bylaws. The change also eliminates potential concerns regarding the status of any discussions between the president and individual board members under the Tennessee Open Meetings Act. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board approved the proposed revisions to the Bylaws, as set forth in *Resolution 006-2020*, by unanimous roll call vote.

# XI. Annual Performance Review of Interim President Boyd

As announced at the last Board meeting and in accordance with the Board's Policy on Presidential Performance Reviews, Chair Compton indicated that he conducted an annual review of Interim President Randy Boyd's performance. Trustee Amy Miles, Chair of the Audit and Compliance Committee, and Trustee Bill Rhodes, Chair of the Finance and Administration Committee, participated in the review process. A full copy of the written assessment was made available was distributed to the members of the Executive Committee, the full Board, and to the public in the meeting materials posted in connection with today's meeting. Chair Compton outlined the process, as well as highlights from the performance review.

#### The Review Process

- Interim President Boyd submitted a written self-assessment.
- An electronic survey (360-degree review) was distributed, soliciting feedback from various constituencies, including -
  - > Trustees;
  - Senior Leadership (Campus and System);
  - Faculty, Student and Staff Leadership; and
  - The Boards of the UT Alumni Association and the Foundations.

#### Survey Results

Over 100 individuals participated in the survey, representing an aggregate response rate of almost 90%.

The electronic survey produced high marks overall for Interim President Boyd, with approximately 94% of respondents rating his performance as exceeding expectations. Overall, he received the highest ratings for:

- Visionary leadership;
- Demonstrating integrity;
- ➤ Providing leadership to ensure the University maintains highly effective relationships with the state legislature and state officials; and
- > Serving as an effective spokesperson for public higher education in Tennessee.

# <u>Interviews</u>

- <u>Chancellors</u> Individual interviews were conducted with the Chancellors of each of the campuses.
- <u>Tennessee Legislative Officials</u> As required under the Board Policy, Interim President Boyd's performance was discussed with Lt. Governor and Speaker of the Senate Randy McNally and Speaker of the House of Representatives Cameron Sexton. In addition, feedback was solicited from



Senator Dolores Gresham, who serves as the Chair of the Senate's Standing Committee on Education.

Chair Compton reported that the reviews of Interim President Boyd's performance were very positive. Through his efforts to engage, listen, and communicate regularly, Interim President Boyd has been effective in improving the perception of the University and in building relationships with members of the state legislature. His ability to think big, resolve issues, and be innovative were listed among his strongest leadership qualities. Appreciation was expressed for Interim President Boyd's commitment to being active across the state, advancing the University's relationship with the Oak Ridge National Laboratory, and considering new ways for the University to serve as a resource for the state and not exist solely as an entity of the state. Chair Compton also thanked the members of the Board for their efforts in engaging and listening to constituencies, which has not gone unnoticed by members of the legislature.

# Proposed 2020 Goals

On January 17, 2020, at the meeting of the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees, Interim President Boyd presented his proposed goals for 2020. The goals include a mix of qualitative and quantitative measures, along with stretch goals the full efforts of which may not be fully realized for several years. Following discussion, members of the Executive Committee expressed their support of the goals identified.

# Highlights of Performance Review

Chair Compton advised that he met with Interim President Boyd on January 24, 2020 to review his performance and goals.

In addition to the constituent feedback, Interim President Boyd's performance was measured against the goals identified in the Strategic Plan 2019-2025. Chair Compton said that Interim President Boyd had an exceptional first year, during which time he has championed three major initiatives – UT Promise, UTIA/UTK reunification, and the Oak Ridge Institute that should be legacy defining. Chair Compton advised that a detailed summary of accomplishments by goal area was included in the written assessment. In closing his remarks, Chair Compton summarized Interim President Boyd's strengths as follows:

- Visionary, Servant Leader;
- Empowers People to Be Better and Think Bigger;
- Passion for UT, which includes serving in voluntary/unpaid capacity;
- Willingness to Engage with all Stakeholders; Takes feedback well; and
- Government Relations Advocate, with strong presence in Nashville and across the state.

Chair Compton opened the floor for questions and comments from other members of the Board regarding Interim President Boyd's performance. Trustees expressed their gratitude to Chair Compton for the transparent and thorough performance review, which process involved a large and varied group of key internal and external stakeholders. The Board members voiced their appreciation for Interim President Boyd's servant style of leadership and the open lines of communication. Student Trustee



Spencer Ammen remarked on the students' favorable view of Interim President Boyd. The board members thanked Interim President Boyd for his efforts in advancing the reputation of the University and his willingness to tackle a number of very important issues in a relatively short period of time. Trustees conveyed that they have received calls from alumni and other individuals for the Board to remove the interim title.

Interim President Boyd thanked his team for all their efforts. He stated that it has been an honor to serve the University and to work with the Board. Interim President Boyd believes that, together, a lot of great things can be accomplished, and he hopes to have the opportunity to continue to serve for a few more years.

Chair Compton excused Interim President Boyd for the next portion of the board meeting, and the Board took a five-minute recess.

# Next Steps

Chair Compton encouraged all individuals present, in addition to the Trustees, to share their views and to actively participate in the Board's next discussion.

Chair Compton reminded the members of the Board that the interim appointment of Randy Boyd was for a two-year period, which is set to expire in November. He indicated that the major question for consideration by the Board is what to do next with respect to filling the president position, in light of the findings from the annual performance review process. Chair Compton reviewed the language set forth in the bylaws, which calls for the Chair to outline a formal search process when a chair has determined that a search should take place.

In this regard, Chair Compton expressed his opinion that a search should not be undertaken given: (i) the current positive momentum: (ii) the strong results of the annual performance review; (iii) the length of time involved with conducting a formal search process; and (iv) the level of uncertainty associated with conducting a search (noting other recent failed searches in higher education). He explained that the legislative leadership is in favor of the University proceeding without a search. While an important stakeholder, they represent just one of many important voices that need to be considered.

Chair Compton solicited the views of the other members of the Board as to whether to proceed without a formal search, recognizing that such an approach is unusual in the higher education environment. The Trustees expressed their concerns over challenges facing higher education institutions (projected declines in high school graduates, cost pressures, and the increasingly competitive landscape). While the survey provides support for proceeding without a search, it reflects a small percentage of key stakeholders (faculty, staff and students). After a lengthy discussion, Chair Compton asked whether anyone was in favor of conducting a formal search process. Hearing no support for such action, he turned to the issue of how to best ensure that the faculty and students are aligned with the position of the Board and other key stakeholders.



As a final step in the process, it was suggested that a series of public forums would be held on each of the UT campuses, where Randy Boyd would be asked to share his vision for serving as the next president of the University, based on a limited, term appointment of an additional five-years (until 2025). The forums would allow for an open dialogue and direct feedback. The Board's website would also be open for receiving public comment. Members of the Board, the Advisory Boards, and leadership of the faculty senates student government associations would be invited to participate. Following the forums, a special meeting of the Board would be scheduled. The Chancellors expressed their support for hosting the forums. Natalie Campbell, Student Government President for UTK, remarked that the student government presidents had each been given the opportunity to participate in the survey process. She voiced her support for the public forums and thanked Chair Compton and the Board for granting the students an opportunity to contribute to this important conversation.

Interim President Boyd was invited back into the meeting. Chair Compton recapped the Board's discussion and advised that the Board is requesting that he participate in a series of public forums as a final step in the process. Interim President Boyd expressed his enthusiasm for the forums and having the opportunity to share his vision for the University.

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board approved the annual performance review and the 2020 goals, as set forth in *Resolution* 007-2020.

# XII. Consent Agenda

The Chair asked whether any Trustee wanted to move any item from the Consent Agenda for discussion. Hearing no requests, the Chair called for a motion to adopt the relevant Resolutions set forth in the materials. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board approved the items set forth in the Consent Agenda. (A complete list of the approved items on the Consent Agenda appears at the end of these minutes.)

#### XIII. Other Business

None.

#### XIV. Closing Remarks

Chair Compton thanked everyone for their participation and advised that a special meeting of the Board would be scheduled in the near future.

#### XV. Adjournment

With no further business to come before the Board, the Chair adjourned the meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,

Cynthia C. Moore

Secretary and Special Counsel

Cynthia C. Moore



# Approved Consent Agenda Items

- Minutes of the Last Meeting (November 8, 2019)
- Ratification of Corrected 2019 Annual Report to the General Assembly
- Items from the Education, Research, and Service Committee
  - 1) 2020 Institutional Mission Profile Statements
  - 2) Proposed Department Name Chance, Haslam College of Business, UTK
  - 3) Grant of Tenure upon Initial Appointment, UTK
  - 4) New Academic Programs:
    - Bachelor of Science Degree in Education, Deaf Studies Major, American Sign Language Concentration, UTK
    - Master of Legal Studies, UTK
  - 5) Proposed Faculty Handbook Revision, UTK
- Items from the Finance and Administration Committee
  - 1) UTHSC Long-Range Master Plan
  - 2) Distribution of Corpus from Robert L. Barksdale Men's Tennis Program Endowment, UTK
  - 3) Knoxville Utilities Board Gas Line Easement, UTK

Attachments. Copies of the following documents are filed with the official minutes of this meeting.

- Remarks of Katie Galyon
- Annual Performance Review of Interim President Boyd