



THE UNIVERSITY OF TENNESSEE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES

MINUTES OF THE EDUCATION, RESEARCH, AND SERVICE COMMITTEE
February 19, 2020
Chattanooga, Tennessee

The Education, Research, and Service Committee of the Board of Trustees met at 8:00 a.m. EST on Wednesday, February 19, 2020, in Chattanooga, Tennessee.

I. Call to Order and Opening Remarks

Committee Chair Donnie Smith called the meeting to order.

II. Roll Call

Board Secretary Cynthia Moore called the roll, and the following members were present: Donnie Smith, Committee Chair; Spencer Ammen; Randy Boyd, Interim President; John Compton, Board Chair; Charlie Hatcher; Jeff Rogers; Alan Wilson; and Jamie Woodson. Ms. Moore announced the presence of a quorum. Other Trustees, administrative staff, faculty members, students, and representatives of the media were also present. The meeting was webcast.

III. Requests to Address the Board

Committee Chair Smith recognized Owen Flomberg, President of the Student Basic Needs Coalition at UT Knoxville, who made a request to address the Board on the subject of student food insecurity. Mr. Flomberg discussed the following items:

- A recent study, which found that UT campuses have the following rates of food insecurity: UTK - 32%; UTC - 44%; UTM 43.5%; and UTHSC - 18%.
- Proposed legislation (Tennessee House Bill 2823 and Senate Bill 2660) that would mandate food pantries at all public 4-year education institutions. Mr. Flomberg noted that UTK does not currently meet the requirements of the proposed legislation.
- Student Basic Needs Coalition's support for a proposal "End Hunger/FEED Change" that is being submitted in connection with the One UT Collaboration and Innovation Grants initiative.

Mr. Flomberg closed his remarks by inviting Board members to meet and learn more about food and other basic needs insecurities of students. Mr. Flomberg responded to questions raised by members of the Committee regarding: (i) the definition of food insecurity, (ii) other basic needs and insecurities, including financial insecurity, and (iii) the meal sharing program on the UT Knoxville campus. Committee Chair Smith thanked Mr. Flomberg for bringing this issue to the Committee's attention. (The handouts provided to the Committee are filed with these minutes.)



IV. Consent Agenda

The Committee Chair then called the Committee members' attention to the Consent Agenda and asked if there were any requests to remove an item from the Consent Agenda for discussion. There being none, upon motion duly made and seconded, the Committee approved the Resolution to adopt the minutes of the November 8, 2019 meeting of the Committee and to recommend the action items for approval by the Board of Trustees. (A complete list of the approved items on the Consent Agenda appears at the end of these minutes.)

V. Grant of Tenure upon Initial Appointment, UTK

Interim President Boyd stated that he and Chancellor Plowman are recommending that tenure be granted to Dr. Ellen McIntyre upon her initial appointment as a faculty member at UT Knoxville in the Department of Theory and Practice in Teacher Education in the College of Education, Health, and Human Services. Interim President Boyd advised that Dr. McIntyre meets the requirements to be considered for tenure upon initial appointment, all steps in the review process outlined in the Board policy have been completed, and Dr. McIntyre has received strong support at each level of review. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Committee approved the Resolution recommending that the Board of Trustees grant tenure to Dr. Ellen McIntyre in connection with her faculty appointment.

VI. New Academic Programs

The Committee Chair indicated that there are two new academic programs being advanced by UT Knoxville for the Committee's consideration.

Bachelor of Science Degree in Education, Deaf Studies Major, American Sign Language (ASL) Concentration

David Manderscheid, UT Knoxville Provost and Senior Vice Chancellor, and Dr. Kimberly Wolbers, a Professor in the Department of Theory and Practice in Teacher Education and Coordinator of the Deaf Education Program, presented simultaneously an overview of the proposed program, which provides an undergraduate pathway to become an American Sign Language (ASL) teacher. Under recent Tennessee legislation, high school students may take ASL to meet foreign language credit and Tennessee higher education institutions must allow ASL to satisfy foreign language requirements for admission to undergraduate programs. The presentation addressed the demand for the program, expected outcomes, and projected enrollment. In response to an inquiry as to the threshold for enrollment when considering a new program, Dr. Manderscheid stated that a minimum of 20 students is standard, but the analysis also considers the amount of resources needed and the projected demand. With respect to the proposed program, he explained that enrollment is projected to grow. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Committee approved the Resolution recommending that the Board of Trustees approve the new academic program.



Master of Legal Studies (MSL)

Dr. Manderscheid presented an overview of the proposed program. He indicated that the degree is intended for those whose careers intersect with the law and need to be conversant in the law, but do not wish to practice law. Likely applicants would include working professionals and graduate students in other colleges. Dr. Manderscheid discussed the growth in enrollment nationally of non-JD students and provided information regarding similar programs being offered by other law schools, including peer institutions. He explained that the MSL students would take classes with law school (JD) students and that existing faculty/resources are sufficient for offering the program. Moving forward, it is anticipated that these classes will also be offered in an online format. In response to questions raised by Committee members, Dr. Manderscheid addressed the timeline for implementing the program, as well as the online delivery. He also advised that the program does not lead to a JD degree. MSL students would have to apply into the JD program. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Committee approved the Resolution recommending that the Board of Trustees approve the new academic program.

VII. Proposed Faculty Handbook Revision, UTK

Dr. Linda Martin informed the Committee that under the Board of Trustees Policies Governing Academic Freedom, Responsibility, and Tenure, campus Faculty Handbook changes require the approval of the Board of Trustees. She reviewed three proposed revisions to the UT Knoxville Faculty Handbook pertaining to:

- Section 4.2.9 – Adding the rank of emeritus for non-tenure-track faculty who have attained the highest rank in the category of their appointment;
- Section 4.5.2 – Addition of requirement that departments and colleges define criteria and expectations for the promotion of non-tenure-track faculty; and
- Appendix: Evaluation and Promotion of Non-Tenure-Tract Faculty – Appendix provides guidance on the procedures for evaluation and promotion of non-tenure-track faculty, similar to that provided for tenure-track faculty.

Trustee Jamie Woodson raised a general question regarding the University's policies and practices for granting and standards for removing emeriti status, including how the University compares with its peers in this area. Dr. Martin advised that the granting of emeriti status to non-tenure-track faculty is a common trend nationally. She explained the general process for granting emeriti status, noting that, with respect to UT Knoxville faculty, approximately 87% of those eligible receive emeriti status. With respect to the removal of emeriti status, the University's current policies, as well as most peer institutions, do not address this subject. Trustee Woodson requested that the UT System and campuses revisit the policies, especially with respect to whether it would be appropriate to address the removal of emeriti status, given the reputational risk to the University associated with the distinction granted. Chancellor Plowman recommended that the review also assess what rights and privileges are associated with the granting of emeriti status.



Board Chair Compton asked and received confirmation from Gary Skolits, President of the Faculty Senate for UT Knoxville, that the faculty were supportive of the proposed revisions to the Faculty Handbook.

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Committee approved the Resolution recommending that the Board of Trustees approve the revisions to the UT Knoxville Faculty Handbook.

VIII. Overview of Accreditation Standards and Reviews

Dr. Jorge Pérez, Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs and Student Success provided an overview of accreditation standards and reviews. Dr. Pérez explained that accreditation is voluntary self-regulation, which encompasses peer review and prescribed standards, that is intended to assure and improve academic quality. He discussed the various types of accreditation (institutional and programmatic), noting that the UT campuses are accredited by the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools Commission on Colleges (SACSCOC). Dr. Pérez reviewed the framework of the SACSCOC Principles, along with the decennial accreditation cycle.

In addition, he provided additional information regarding the reaffirmation process and where each campus stands in the reaffirmation cycle. In this regard, Dr. Pérez noted that UTHSC had submitted its self-study in September 2019 and that an on-site visit is scheduled for early April 2020. Dr. Pérez described the role that the UT System administration serves in connection with the accreditation process, and he concluded his remarks by highlighting items that the University is monitoring with respect to federal regulations and other possible changes in the area of accreditation. In response to questions raised regarding the blurring of lines between regional and national accreditation. Dr. Pérez indicated that a shift to a free market system for accreditation may have certain advantages and/or disadvantages to higher education institutions and the students they serve.

IX. Update on UT Research Enterprise

Dr. Stacey Patterson, Vice President for Research, Outreach and Economic Development, provided an update on the University's research. She began her remarks by referencing Goal #2 - Expanding Research Capacities as set forth in the revised Strategic Plan approved by the Board. The priorities under this Goal include:

- Raising the Prominence of UT's Research Profile Nationally;
- Expanding Participation of Faculty, Staff and Students in Research; and
- Enhancing the Impact of UT's Research Programs.

Dr. Patterson indicated that the National Science Foundation (NSF) Higher Education Research and Development (HERD) Survey is the gold standard and serves as the primary source of information on research and development expenditures at U.S. colleges and universities. She



reported that the University (system-wide) research expenditures reached an all-time high of \$425 million for FY2019, a 2% increase over FY2018. She stated that the increase did not meet the 7% stretch goal set forth in the Strategic Plan. However, the prior year's annual increase was 15%. For the 10-year period (FY2009 - FY2018), the University's experienced a 46.5% growth in research funding, at a time when the total amount of research funding provided to all U.S. colleges and universities grew by only 38.4%.

The University's federal research expenditures increased 5.9%, over FY2018. For the same 10-year period, the University experienced a 19.3% increase in federal research funding, at a time when the aggregate pool of federal funding grew by 25.4%.

Dr. Patterson reviewed the UT Campus rankings, as published by The Center for Measuring University of Performance (MUP) in its Top American Research Universities 2018 Annual Report ("Lombardi Rankings"). She noted that, if UTK and UTIA had been combined for the reporting period, it would have moved into the top 50.

In addition, Dr. Patterson discussed the importance of the Tennessee Governor's Chairs, the collaboration and co-location of Volkswagen at Cherokee Farm, the development of the Oak Ridge Institute (ORI), and the participation in the One UT Collaboration and Innovation Grants initiative. With respect to research impact, she presented information on the number of research publications, citations, and certain measures of citation impact (Category Normalized Citation Impact (CNCI)). From a technology transfer perspective, she reviewed the number of invention disclosures, commercial licenses, licensing revenues and other funding received by the University through UT Research Foundation's subsidiary entities. She closed her remarks by highlighting recent efforts to showcase research activities (e.g., Startup Showcase and UT Day on the Hill).

Dr. Patterson answered questions regarding research rankings and how they impact recruitment of faculty, as well as students. She also provided an update on funding for ORI, noting that the Governor has recommended \$10 million in funding. The University will also submit a proposal in connection with a \$20 million Notice of Intent (NOI) issued by the U.S. Department of Energy. Dr. Patterson explained how this funding, if received, would contribute to the University's research rankings. Interim President Boyd commented upon the positive impact of the research demonstrations that were presented at the UT Day on the Hill and suggested a similar showcase at a future Board meeting.

X. Update on UT Academic Affairs and Student Success

Institutional Effectiveness

Dr. Martin updated the Committee on an organizational restructuring that brings together Institutional Research and Business Intelligence under the Office of Academic Affairs and Student Success. These areas, along with Planning, Assessment and Accreditation, support the creation of a new "Institutional Effectiveness" group that will provide leadership for the UT System.



UT Promise

Dr. Martin reviewed the qualifying criteria for the UT Promise program, along with the 3 components of the program (last dollar scholarship, volunteer mentors, and community service requirement). She advised that the University has received over 7,000 applications for the UT Promise program, with approximately 4,200 applications from high school seniors and more than 2,800 applications from current students. Dr. Martin stated the applicants may not meet all the eligibility requirements for the program, and she mentioned that mentors are being recruited for the program.

Student Mental Health and Wellbeing

Dr. Martin provided information on the Academic Affairs and Student Affairs Summit held on November 22, 2019, entitled "Building a Unified and Supportive Mental Health Culture." It was a system-wide summit on mental health and wellness that was attended by more than 100 individuals, including representatives from the Tennessee Higher Education Commission (THEC) and other agencies. The summit focused on best practices, sharing of information on initiatives, and a planning session for setting goals for the upcoming year. Dr. Martin noted the challenges of meeting the increasing demands for mental health services. She highlighted that strategies will focus on: (i) prevention; (ii) training, including helping students become aware of and seek services available; (iii) providing support to those who provide mental health services; and (v) establishing a system-wide working group.

One UT for Campus Change

Dr. Martin reviewed the efforts that are underway to remove barriers for students transferring from one UT Campus to another. She advised that, in the past, the process mirrored those for students who were transferring from other universities/colleges that are outside the UT System. The intention is to make the process more seamless and efficient for students who wish to transfer within the UT System.

UT.Online

The last update was on a consortium model being developed for sharing UT classes online. Dr. Martin discussed the potential benefits to students, including increased offerings and flexibility. She also indicated that it has the potential to provide increased enrollments for the current online classes.

Dr. Martin responded to various questions from the Committee members on a number of the presentation topics, including the anticipated incremental impact on enrollment associated with the UT Promise. The Committee members expressed their support for the new initiatives intended to remove barriers for students, which are especially important for first generation students. Faculty Representative Jeff Rogers thanked Dr. Martin and others involved who have been working on solutions for supporting mental health needs.



XI. Enrollment Comparisons with Board-Approved Peers and Aspirational Peers

As a follow-up from the Fall 2019 Committee meeting, Dr. Martin provided a detailed report to the Committee on enrollment, retention and graduation by campus against peer institutions (presented under Tab 5 of the meeting materials). The graphs presented include each UT Campus, its peer group, aspirational peers, and SEC institutions for UTK and Tennessee locally governed institutions (LGIs) for the other UT Campuses. For purposes of her remarks, she focused on the changes in each of these areas. The comparison reporting period covered 2006-2018.

Undergraduate Enrollment

- **Change in Total Undergraduate Enrollment.** Undergraduate enrollment has increased for all UT Campuses; however, except for UTC, the rate of growth was below that of the peer institutions.
- **Change in First-Year Undergraduate Enrollment.** Undergraduate enrollment has increased for all UT Campuses; however, except for UTC, the rate of growth lagged peer institutions.
- **First-Year Undergraduate In-State Enrollment.** First-year, in-state undergraduate enrollment at all campuses exceeded peer and aspirational peer institutions.

Board Chair Compton requested that, for future reports, it would be useful to address the pipeline of students (applications, admission offers, acceptances, matriculation), along with the absolute numbers associated with the mix of students (in-state and out-of-state students). In light of the competition for students, it was highlighted that while the University's growth has increased peers are growing as fast or faster.

Graduate and Professional Studies Enrollment

- **Change in Graduate and Professional Enrollment.** With the exception of UTHSC, headcount for all UT campuses lagged behind that of all peer groups. For the comparison period, graduate and professional student enrollment increased at UTK and UTHSC, but decreased at UTC and UTM.

Undergraduate Retention

- **First-Year Undergraduate Retention.** Except for UTM, undergraduate first-year retention was slightly less than first-year retention for peer institutions. Undergraduate first-year retention for all campuses lags aspirational peers. However, the percentage increase in undergraduate first-year retention for each campus exceeded their peer institutions and, in most instances, exceeded the percentage increases of aspirational institutions.



Undergraduate Graduation Rates

- **Six-Year Graduation Rates.** All campuses exceeded their peer institutions, but lagged aspirational peers.
- **Four-Year Graduation Rates.** All campuses exceeded their peer institutions, with UTC and UTM exceeding their aspirational peers' four-year graduation rates. The campuses percentage increase in four-year graduation rates exceeded both peer and aspirational peer institutions.

Trustee Bill Rhodes noted the remarkable change in undergraduate four-year graduation. The Chancellors highlighted strategies that have been effective in making meaningful change. Interim President Boyd praised the focused efforts in this area, including Chancellor summits on student success. He acknowledged Dr. Yancy Freeman's achievements in reducing the equity gap between underrepresented minority and other students.

XII. Other Business (none brought to the Chair's attention prior to the meeting)

None.

XIII. Adjournment

Committee Chair Smith thanked Chancellor Angle for hosting the Board, noting that the time spent with students has been inspirational. Chancellor Angle thanked his team for their efforts.

There being no other business, the Committee Chair adjourned the meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Cynthia C. Moore".

Cynthia C. Moore
Secretary and Special Counsel



Approved Consent Agenda Items

- Minutes of the Last Meeting (November 8, 2019)
- 2020 Institutional Mission Profile Statements
- Proposed Department Name Change, Haslam College of Business, UTK

List of Information Items Presented to the Committee

- Certification of Degrees Conferred, 2019 Fall Semester

Attachments. Copies of the following documents are filed with the official minutes of this meeting.

- Student Basic Needs Coalition Handouts
- Presentation Materials:
 - New Academic Programs
 - Overview of Accreditation Standards and Reviews
 - Update on UT Research Enterprise
 - Update on UT Academic Affairs and Student Success
 - Enrollment Comparisons with Board-Approved Peers and Aspirational Peers
 - UT System Performance Compared to Peers (Infographic)